Articulation Development of Children with a Hearing Loss: Results from an Auditory-Oral Program

Presented By: Monica Brumbaugh, MA, CCC-SLP
Brandi Harveth, MA, CCC-SLP

Child’s Voice School
Wood Dale, IL
Agenda

• Demographics of Child’s Voice
• Comparison of articulation development of the children who received Early Intervention (EI) at Child’s Voice to:
  • Children who did not receive EI services at Child’s Voice
  • Previous research on children with hearing loss
  • Typical Development
Child’s Voice School

- Moog curriculum auditory-oral school
- Founded in 1996 by three families
- Provide children with a learning experience that nurtures self-esteem, independence, creativity, and problem-solving skills while developing listening, speech, and language skills
- We strive for our students to successfully mainstream into their home school district
Demographics

Children in the school based program (43)

- 14 did not receive any EI services at Child’s Voice (32.5%)
- 15 received EI services for <17 months at Child’s Voice (35%)
- 14 received EI services for >18 months at Child’s Voice (32.5%)
- 67.5% of the children enrolled in our school program have attended some EI services at Child’s Voice

Child’s Voice

an oral school for children who are deaf or hard of hearing
Age of Diagnosis
Children in the school based program (43)

- Age of amplification ranges from 2 months to 5 years, 7 months
  - 26 children were amplified before 2 years of age (60.5%)
  - 6 children were amplified between 2 and 3 years of age (14%)
  - 11 were amplified after 3 (25.5%)

Child’s Voice
an oral school for children who are deaf or hard of hearing
Device(s) Used

Children in the school based program (43)

- Bilateral Cochlear Implants (CI): 15 (35%)
- Hearing Aid (HA): 14 (32.5%)
- Unilateral CI: 9 (21%)
- Binaural Amplification (CI/HA): 5 (11.5%)
Professionals Providing Services

Early Intervention and School Team

- 1 Executive Director (LSLS Certified AVEd)
- 1 School Coordinator (LSLS Certified AVEd)
- 1 EI Coordinator (Speech Language Pathologist)
- 1 Pediatric Audiologist
- 1 Developmental Therapist-Hearing
- 4 Speech Language Pathologists
- 13 Teachers of the Deaf (3 LSLS Certified)
Goldman-Fristoe Test of Articulation – 2nd Edition (GFTA-2) Trends
GFTA-2

• All 43 children were given the GFTA-2
• Method of assessing an individual’s articulation of the consonant sounds in Standard American English
• 34 pictures plates and 51 target words
• Elicits the articulation of 61 consonant sounds in all positions and 16 consonant clusters in the initial position
• Average standard score is 85-115
Findings

• Children who received EI services at Child’s Voice for greater than 18 months had an average standard score of 85

• Children who did not receive EI services at Child’s Voice had an average standard score of 71
Child's Voice

an oral school for children who are deaf or hard of hearing
EI Services Provided

Home-based Therapy:
- Help parents become confident facilitators of their child’s listening and spoken language
- Therapy includes working with parents and other therapists to implement the strategies stated in the Individualized Family Service Plan (IFSP)

Child’s Voice
an oral school for children who are deaf or hard of hearing
EI Services Provided

Center-based therapy (Group Individual)

• Ages 18 months to 3 years old
• Attend Group Aural Rehabilitation (AR) 2-3 mornings per week for 150-210 minutes
• Group AR is designed to enhance speech, language, auditory, and social skills
• Receive individual AR and/or Speech Therapy
• Parent education
Demographics
Children who received EI services at Child’s Voice for greater than 18 months (14)

- Age range: 2:10 to 5:10 (average age 4:0)
- Gender: 4 Girls, 10 Boys
- Age of amplification ranges from 2 months to 23 months
- All were amplified before 2 years (100%)
Device(s) Used

Children who received EI services at Child’s Voice for greater than 18 months (14)

• Bilateral CI: 6 (43%)
• HA: 4 (29%)
• Unilateral CI: 3 (21%)
• Binaural Amplification (CI/HA): 1 (7%)
Trends in Articulation Development

*Previous research on children with hearing loss*
Trends in Articulation Development

Previous research on children with hearing loss

1. Errors producing /t, d, s, z, “sh”, “ch”, “dz”/
   Only /d, t, s, “sh”, “ch”/ are mastered or emerging by 4
2. Decreased accuracy producing less visual sounds
3. Final consonant deletion
4. Substituting stops for fricatives and liquids
5. Substituting voiced for voiceless sounds
6. Confusion of oral and nasal consonants

Child’s Voice

an oral school for children who are deaf or hard of hearing
#1 Errors producing 
/d, t, s, “sh”, “ch”/

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sounds emerging by 4</th>
<th>% in error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>/d/</td>
<td>23.81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mastered by 4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/t/</td>
<td>14.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/s/</td>
<td>57.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“sh”</td>
<td>30.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“ch”</td>
<td>30.95%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Our children are still having difficulty producing /d/ and /s/

Child’s Voice

an oral school for children who are deaf or hard of hearing
#2 Decreased accuracy producing less visual sounds

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sounds mastered by 4</th>
<th>% of Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>/p, m, n, w, b, f, d/ visual sounds</td>
<td>15.79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/k, g/ less visual sounds</td>
<td>11.67%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Our children did not have a decreased accuracy producing less visual sounds
## Final consonant deletion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Error in Final Position</th>
<th>% of Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Omission</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distortion</td>
<td>11.82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Substitution</td>
<td>38.18%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Our children continue to omit final consonants.
#4 Substituting stops for fricatives and liquids

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manner</th>
<th>Substituting stops (p, b, t, d, k, g)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fricatives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f, s, “sh”</td>
<td>12.69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glides/Liquids</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>w, “y”, l, r</td>
<td>2.68%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Our children are not following this articulation trend
#5  Substituting voiced for voiceless sounds

Of the errors on voiceless sounds (t, k, p, f) **15%** were substitutions of voiced sounds (d, g, m, n, b)
#6  Confusion of oral and nasal consonants

Of the errors on oral consonants 1.63% were substitutions of nasal consonants (m, n, “ng”)
Trends in Articulation Development

Typical Development
Trends in Articulation Development

Typical Development

Sounds mastered by 3: /h, m, p, w, n/

Sounds mastered by 4: /*y*/ , k, g, b, d, f/

Sounds emerging by 4: /t, “ng”, r, l, s, “ch”, “sh”, z/

Mastery is the age level at which 90% of all children are consistently producing the sound
# Trends in Articulation Development

*Typical Development*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sounds mastered by 3</th>
<th>% in error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>/h/</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/m/</td>
<td>4.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/p/</td>
<td>7.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/w/</td>
<td>7.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/n/</td>
<td>11.90%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Trends in Articulation Development

**Typical Development**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sounds mastered by 4</th>
<th>% in error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“y”</td>
<td>7.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/k/</td>
<td>11.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/g/</td>
<td>11.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/b/</td>
<td>16.67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/d/</td>
<td>23.81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/f/</td>
<td>30.95%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Trends in Articulation Development

Typical Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sounds emerging at 4</th>
<th>% in error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>/t/</td>
<td>14.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“ch”</td>
<td>30.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“sh”</td>
<td>30.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“ng”</td>
<td>32.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/r/</td>
<td>45.24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/s/</td>
<td>57.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/l/</td>
<td>64.29%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Trends in Articulation Development

Typical Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age of mastery</th>
<th>% in error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emerging by 4</td>
<td>39.29%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Our children follow patterns similar to their typically developing peers

We are seeing higher accuracy producing earlier developing sounds (h, m, p) and decreased accuracy producing later developing sounds (r, s, l)

Child’s Voice

an oral school for children who are deaf or hard of hearing
References


